



General Meeting 2 June 2022

Minutes

First Nations acknowledgement

Guest speaker

Dr Ian Dyson, Coastal and Environmental Geologist, will present a scientific overview of the coastal dynamics of beach erosion between West Beach and North Haven and potential methods for future management.

A video of Ian's presentation 'Saving Adelaide's beaches', including audio, are available on the WACRA website: <http://wacra.org.au/news-events/meetings/>

Questions to Ian Dyson from the floor:

Q: Can O'Sullivan's Beach boat ramp be improved? Could a jetty be provided/rebuilt for the boat ramp?

A: There's no easy solution. When that boat ramp went in it was possibly the death knell for Hallett Cove. A jetty is worth considering, but you need to stop the sand from South Beach at Christies. The sand today is 2x the width of what it used to be. The sand has gone from South Beach.

Q: Suggestion of a containment for sand brought in, how long would it take for the sand to hold permanently?

A: You would slow it down considerably, and I've suggested this to Charles Sturt. We haven't done that work as it got vetoed by the government. But the sand could be held for considerably more than 2 or 3 months.

Q: With the new government, is there any hope of change in approach?

A: I've written to the new premier and the minister but there is no response as yet. The problem is that if you let it go too much further you'll say no more sand replacement and there will just be pocket beaches. I don't think it's that far off it, certainly within another 5 years.

Q: Do you do a pipeline or trucking? And where do you get the sand from?

A: Trucking has its disadvantages, but you're not going to run the pipeline past people's front yards. The previous pipeline at West Beach was under engineered. Re the pipeline – where do you put it? The contentious issue is do you put it through the swale and the dunes? I would have it where the berm should be and bury it deep enough so that it's not going to affect the formation of the berm. But I haven't looked into it deeply. The other option is don't do anything, and that's not a good option.

Q: Massive quantities of sand must be needed. How many hundreds of thousands of cubic metres might be required?

A: 6 and 7 figures mentioned as to how much would be required, but you have to be very smart about it. They talk about supplying 115,000 cubic metres a year but I don't think that's enough. You've also got to build up that profile to start off with. Potentially at West Beach South you're going to be building up the sand profile by 3 metres.

Q: The pipeline or trucks debate is a false dichotomy. There are other options. How can we slow the rate of erosion through Glenelg North – a groyne field is a good idea, do you think?

A: Yes, I agree. What's happened is that the sand has escaped to 10km down the coast. It shouldn't be allowed to go that far. An optimum beach cell should be 1200-1700 metres in width. Then do the calculations to determine the optimum spacing of soft sandbag groynes.

Q: What is 'riprap'?

A: The large bluestone blocks that you see as a sea wall, to protect the dunes, and increasingly property. The riprap has just been replaced at West Beach Surf Club.

Q: What about installing offshore artificial reefs to slow the ocean during big storms?

A: They're worth considering for sure, and how far out you go. It's a 'tombolo' effect – the reef could impede waves that are coming through. If it's close enough to the shore you can build up the sand that way.

Q: What is the timeline involved to get to something that's going to be effective for decades, and the projected costs?

A: I did some initial estimating a few years ago. It was considerably cheaper doing it that way.

Q: There is a difference between sand bars at West Beach and Semaphore, would sandbag groynes help that?

A: Yes, sandbag groynes would give West Beach a helping hand. They might need to be constructed in two stages to build it up. But it depends what the substrate is made of (it could be rocky, clay, sand). Once you know that it's an engineering design.

Q: When the sand shore eroded, did the banks go first and then the dunes?

A: Yes, once you cut off sand supply the sandbars will go... Sand going out has to be matched by sand coming in, which is why we have these problems immediately downdrift of a headland or breakwater. The sand will still move out, whether you put sand in there or not.

Q: You wouldn't advocate for any digging at the Torrens Outlet?

A: No, when I saw the mining at Semaphore, you would have thought they would have learnt from the exercise at West Beach where they mined the sand dune and destabilised everything. And of course Henley Beach has lost so much sand now. I suspect that Semaphore is going to be very catastrophic.

Q: What is the role of the Torrens Outlet – is it a natural groyne? How does it operate?

A: The Coastal Protection Board refers to it as a natural groyne or hydraulic groyne. Again, it depends on how much sand is coming through the outlet. It is a natural process. It's not a good idea to destabilise it and mine in that area.

Q: Perhaps that hydrodynamic groyne is important. This could serve to reduce the erosion at West Beach. If West Beach is the focus, in terms of managing within that cell, how far out would the Torrens sandbar have to get to reach equilibrium in that area?

A: I would have to do calculations.

Comment: CPB data around Semaphore and Largs 1970 to the present day – the pattern seems to be that there was a low accretion of sand coming through. What changed things was the introduction of the breakwater at Point Malcolm, which has created a bank up of sand at Semaphore. If we can slow down the pace of sand drift it would be a more natural approach. But every intervention that's been made seems to make things worse.

Q: A systems approach seems like a good idea. Are there enough resources within the community? Is it feasible for a community team to develop a better argument back to the government?

A: There will be a resolution in the form of a recommendation around this question. Introducing Chris Newby, new Manager Special Projects (Adelaide Beach Management Review) – to have a look at the solution.

Q: With the commitment of 500,000 m³ at this stage, how long do you think we've got before that becomes unsustainable?

A: Within 5 years. It's not enough. Trying to restore it back to the levels in 1985/95 is more realistic. It's too expensive to restore it to any earlier than that.

Jim Douglas thanked Ian Dyson for his presentation.

General Meeting

Apologies: Paul Acfield, Sandy Ball, Marty Cielens, Bernadette Cranwell, Marg Easson, Angela Evans, Oksana Holubowycz, Don Howie, Tina Koch, Lara Lamnek, Tom Matthews, Chrissy Schultz, Pedro Schultz, Geoff Short, Kelly Thomas, Lynn Walsh, Anne Wheaton

Moved Julie Whitehead
Seconded Theo Ellenbroek
Carried

Acceptance of General Minutes 3 March

Moved Theo Ellenbroek
Seconded Julie Whitehead
Carried

Financial Report and acceptance

See website for Treasurer's report: <http://wacra.org.au/news-events/meetings/>

Moved Richard Smith
Seconded Julie Whitehead
Carried

Coastal Management

See also the report at the end of the minutes.

Bert Brown moved and spoke to the motion (below). There is a whole range of diverse views as to what should happen and where to go from here, as expressed at this meeting. We want a whole-of-coast approach. We want an independent evaluation and appropriate research, using experts.

The recommendations will go to Susan Close, Minister for Climate, Environment and Water. WACRA is seeking a meeting with her.

Discussion on the motion:

Generally, what is being proposed is good and this should go to the minister directly. It would be good if that team of 5 had independence from the Coastal Protection Board (CPB). It would be best to have a voice reporting directly to the minister (for environment).

We need a timeline – engagement for a maximum of 12 months from committee being formed to final report. At the end of the specified time we would like a substantive response within 6 months. The minister needs to commit to a timeframe that is not open ended.

Point 4: This group of experts has to last beyond 12 months. This issue is not going to be solved in 12 months. There should be an **ongoing** commitment to expertise.

We want a response from that first report but we also want an ongoing response. We request a response within 6 months by a group of professionals with ongoing updates.

Moved Kenzie van den Nieuwelaar
Seconded Geoff Wood
Carried

Final motion: Sand Replenishment Committee Recommendation, 2 June 2022

1. That this meeting of members of the Western Adelaide Coastal Residents Association Inc held 2 June 2022 call on the SA Government to immediately reinstate the promised volume of 500,000 m³ of sand onto West Beach.
2. That the SA Government provide a guarantee to replenish West Beach yearly of the known loss of a minimum of 115,000m³ of sand until such time as an independent scientific solution is implemented.
3. That the SA Government adopt a scientific integrated approach to develop a future coastal management plan by engaging a team of independent scientific experts, reporting directly to the Minister for Climate, Environment and Water, consisting of at least: a Coastal Engineer; a Coastal Geologist; a Marine Surveyor; a Marine Biologist; and an Oceanographer/Computer Modeller.
4. That the contract of engagement be ongoing and the terms of reference of engagement be subject to SA Government and coastal community agreement. That the government commit to a response within 6 months, with an ongoing strategy for a continuing whole-of-coast solution.

Moved Richard Smith

Seconded Julie Whitehead

Carried

My Tree Project/Climate Matters

See report at the end of the minutes.

Julie Whitehead reporting

Latest news: State government has cut money to the budget for the environment so Climate Matters Group work (such as My Tree Project) is even more critical.

Submission to the Draft Annual Business Plan

Andrea Rankin reporting

WACRA submitted a response to council's Draft Annual Business Plan 2022-23 Monday 9 May. The response focused on urging council to address climate change mitigation and adaptation in the budget more strongly, with a considerable financial commitment rather than a 'business as usual' approach.

Andrea Rankin and Marty Cielens gave a deputation on the response to council meeting Monday 23 May outlining the main points of the text response to make councillors aware of WACRA's position. They followed this up with a letter to council sent Wednesday 1 June, outlining in details strategies for addressing four key points: Improve canopy; Prioritise budget bids; Educate the community; and Engage with state government. We await the final budget to compare against our proposals and consider future actions.

Planning and Development Act

Jim Douglas reporting

Community Alliance SA – looking at the planning and design code. Nick Champion is the new minister. We met with him recently and put in front of him the need for the new government to address this act, as they committed to do.

Key issues – review of the planning and design code; increase heritage protection of buildings, parks and trees; ensure equity of access to the planning system and expansion of the commission membership; improve community engagement / empowerment / partnerships; advocate for increase in affordable and public housing, design quality, urban infill, sprawl, climate change.

Theo Ellenbroek: The review needs local input from community groups etc.

Library Hub update

Becky Llewellyn reporting

WACRA has looked at the final plan for the Henley community hub. They want it to be modern, flexible etc. Council has a grant of \$800,000 from the state government. There is a shortfall of \$2 million.

We need a lot of support for this hub. Can meeting attendees promote the hub to others wherever possible and use Your Say to provide feedback:

<https://www.yoursaycharlessturt.com.au/henley-library-and-community-centre?>

Kenzie van den Nieuwelaar: after discussion with the woodwork/toy boys people, the depot they use won't be sold but retained by council.

Q: How will mothers etc get across Military Road?

A: There will be safe crossings for pedestrians. It will slow the traffic down. It's very wide.

Q: What is being done about the Henley and Grange Historical Society which doesn't feel it has been heard?

A: Council has met with them and made some concessions – purpose-built cupboards and a compactus at the depot. Their issues are still unresolved.

It would be good to be able to access the history room from inside the building. WACRA supports this.

There are lots of suggestions and discussions are ongoing.

Q: Do we want a 24-hour library as part of the new design? Provide feedback via Your Say

<https://www.yoursaycharlessturt.com.au/henley-library-and-community-centre>

WACRA history book

Jim Douglas reporting

The ebook (flip book) of *Listen to the people: 50 years of community activism* is now available under a button on the homepage of the WACRA website: <http://wacra.org.au/>. Hard copies are still available for a donation of \$20. Visit <http://wacra.org.au/listen-to-the-people/> for more information.

Any other business

Henley Square

New trees (Norfolk Island pines) have gone up in Henley Square.

Adelaide Coastal Communities Alliance

This is a newly formed group that meets regularly. There is no constitution as yet.

Q: Could WACRA send someone to that group to inform them of what's happening?

A: WACRA has sent a representative to two meetings. We have decided we're happy to participate at meetings but not join the alliance at this stage. We would like to see a way of bringing groups together re coastal management.

Meeting closed 9.17pm

REPORTS

Coastal issues: April/May 2022

- We have requested a meeting with the new Deputy Premier & Minister for Environment Susan Close by letter of 1 April 2022. At this stage no meeting has been scheduled.
- WACRA have also written to Minister Koutsantonis on 16th May seeking a meeting to discuss the pipeline and the Coastal Linear pathway.
- We were advised by DEW on 21 April 2022 that:
 - Construction of the northern pipeline has been halted and ‘a comprehensive review of all coastal management options will be undertaken to identify a long-term solution which puts community and the environment at the core.’
 - Delivery of quarry sand will continue until around 20 May – 10,000m³, making a total of 200,000m³ since August 2021
 - By September 2022/23 FY, ‘up to’ 100,000m³ will be added – up to 50,000m³ quarry sand and up to 50,000m³ of sand from the Semaphore South breakwater.
 - Community Reference Group (CRG) has been disbanded but DEW will re-engage with former CRG members including WACRA
 - Project Manager James Guy has left the Department
- City of Charles Sturt passed resolution on 12th April requesting the Mayor to write to the Premier, Minister for Environment & Minister for Transport & Infrastructure seeking clarification of state government’s approach to sand replenishment. WACRA supported the resolution.
- WACRA Committee on 3rd May endorsed and invited Dr Ian Dyson, Coastal Geologist, to address WACRA General Meeting on 2nd June 2022 ‘to present a scientific overview of the coastal dynamics of beach erosion between West Beach and North Haven’.

Climate Matters Group (CMG): May 2022

(formerly Climate Emergency Group)

Members: Julie Whitehead, Andrea Rankin, Lara Lamnek, Kate Denton, Steve Fuller, Deidre Knight, Marg Easson

My Tree Project

Increasing numbers of teachers and children with COVID delayed the resumption of My Tree Project activities this year. But led by Steve, Deidre and CMG members and with great enthusiasm by the students after seeing how much their plants had grown, workshops to thin and transplant the seedlings planted last year were recently completed at the participating primary schools. Tree and understorey planting will commence from mid-June to the end of July. Permanent signage at the schools is currently being designed.

Art workshops have begun, with focused and excited students producing clay, bark, leaf and gumnut sculptures, drawings, paintings and poetry etc about what trees mean to them. Selected artworks (democratically chosen by the students themselves) will be shown at a public launch at the Charles Sturt Civic Centre on Schools Tree Day, Friday 29 July 2022. As well, an online streaming of every student’s artwork is planned. After a successful SALA (South Australian Living Artists) application, the exhibition will be open for one month. Mayor Angela

Evans of the City of Charles Sturt will launch the exhibition along with other honoured guests TBA.

Marty Cielens has joined the team to film the whole project. It is hoped that a You Tube video of the My Tree Project will ultimately be available as well as reports of the process to be available for future projects.

Heritage trees (state government)

The new state government has a heritage policy ('Heritage for the future') that includes trees: <https://www.petermalinauskas.com.au/policies/protecting-our-heritage>

The relevant minister is Nick Champion (Minister for Planning, Minister for Housing and Urban Development), but local members (including shadow members) are also relevant if residents want to write regarding this policy and pushing state government representatives to protect trees more, especially in these urban infill times and the subsequent cost to green spaces of the Planning and Design Code.